REFERENCE TITLE: juveniles; maximum sentence; commutation

State of Arizona Senate Fifty-fifth Legislature Second Regular Session 2022

## SB 1482

Introduced by Senators Stahl Hamilton: Alston, Gabaldon, Hatathlie, Steele, Terán

## AN ACT

AMENDING SECTIONS 13-716, 13-751, 13-752, 13-1423 AND 13-2308.01, ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES; RELATING TO SENTENCING.

(TEXT OF BILL BEGINS ON NEXT PAGE)

1 Be it enacted by the Legislature of the State of Arizona: 2 Section 1. Section 13-716, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to 3 read: 4 13-716. Juvenile offenders sentence; maximum sentence; life 5 imprisonment; parole eligibility 6 Notwithstanding any other law, a person who is sentenced to life Α. 7 imprisonment with the possibility of release after serving a minimum 8 number of calendar years for an offense that was committed before the 9 person attained eighteen years of age is eligible for parole on completion 10 of service of the minimum sentence, regardless of whether the offense was committed on or after January 1, 1994. If granted parole, the person 11 12 shall remain on parole for the remainder of the person's life except that 13 the person's parole may be revoked pursuant to section 31-415. 14 B. NOTWITHSTANDING ANY OTHER LAW, A PERSON WHO IS SENTENCED TO 15 SERVE A TERM OF IMPRISONMENT, INCLUDING CONSECUTIVE SENTENCES, OF AT LEAST TWENTY-FIVE CALENDAR YEARS FOR AN OFFENSE THAT WAS COMMITTED BEFORE THE 16 17 PERSON ATTAINED EIGHTEEN YEARS OF AGE IS ELIGIBLE FOR PAROLE ON COMPLETION 18 OF SERVICE OF TWENTY-FIVE CALENDAR YEARS. IF GRANTED PAROLE, THE PERSON'S 19 PAROLE MAY BE REVOKED PURSUANT TO SECTION 31-415. 20 Sec. 2. Section 13-751, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to 21 read: 22 13-751. Sentence of death or life imprisonment; aggravating 23 and mitigating circumstances; definition 24 A. If the state has filed a notice of intent to seek the death 25 penalty and the defendant is: 1. Convicted of first degree murder pursuant to section 13-1105, 26 27 subsection A, paragraph 1 or 3 and was at least eighteen years of age at 28 the time of the commission of the offense, the defendant shall be sentenced to death or imprisonment in the custody of the state department 29 30 of corrections for natural life as determined and in accordance with the procedures provided in section 13-752. A defendant who is sentenced to 31 32 natural life is not eligible for commutation, parole, work furlough, work 33 release or release from confinement on any basis. 34 2. Convicted of first degree murder pursuant to section 13-1105 and 35 was under eighteen years of age at the time of the commission of the 36 offense, the defendant shall be sentenced to imprisonment in the custody 37 of the state department of corrections for life or natural life, as 38 determined and in accordance with the procedures provided in section 39 13-752. A defendant who is sentenced to <del>natural</del> life <del>is not eligible for</del> 40 commutation, parole, work furlough, work release or release from 41 confinement on any basis. If the defendant is sentenced to life, the 42 defendant shall not be released on any basis until the completion of the 43 service of twenty-five calendar years if the murdered person was fifteen 44 or more years of age and thirty-five years if the murdered person was 45 under fifteen years of age or was an unborn child.

1 Convicted of first degree murder pursuant to section 13-1105, 3. 2 subsection A, paragraph 2, the defendant shall be sentenced to death or imprisonment in the custody of the state department of corrections for 3 4 life or natural life as determined and in accordance with the procedures 5 provided in section 13-752. A defendant who is sentenced to natural life 6 is not eligible for commutation, parole, work furlough, work release or 7 release from confinement on any basis. If the defendant is sentenced to 8 life, the defendant shall not be released on any basis until the 9 completion of the service of twenty-five calendar years if the murdered 10 person was fifteen or more years of age and thirty-five years if the murdered person was under fifteen years of age or was an unborn child. 11

12 B. At the aggravation phase of the sentencing proceeding that is 13 held pursuant to section 13-752, the admissibility of information relevant 14 to any of the aggravating circumstances set forth in subsection F of this 15 section shall be governed by the rules of evidence applicable to criminal trials. The burden of establishing the existence of any 16 of the 17 aggravating circumstances set forth in subsection F of this section is on 18 the prosecution. The prosecution must prove the existence of the 19 aggravating circumstances beyond a reasonable doubt.

20 C. At the penalty phase of the sentencing proceeding that is held 21 pursuant to section 13-752, the prosecution or the defendant may present 22 any information that is relevant to any of the mitigating circumstances 23 included in subsection G of this section, regardless of its admissibility 24 under the rules governing admission of evidence at criminal trials. The 25 burden of establishing the existence of the mitigating circumstances included in subsection G of this section is on the defendant. 26 The 27 defendant must prove the existence of the mitigating circumstances by a 28 preponderance of the evidence. If the trier of fact is a jury, the jurors 29 do not have to agree unanimously that a mitigating circumstance has been 30 proven to exist. Each juror may consider any mitigating circumstance 31 found by that juror in determining the appropriate penalty.

32 D. Evidence that is admitted at the trial and that relates to any 33 aggravating or mitigating circumstances shall be deemed admitted as 34 evidence at a sentencing proceeding if the trier of fact considering that 35 evidence is the same trier of fact that determined the defendant's guilt. 36 The prosecution and the defendant shall be permitted to rebut any 37 information received at the aggravation or penalty phase of the sentencing 38 proceeding and shall be given fair opportunity to present argument as to whether the information is sufficient to establish the existence of any of 39 40 the circumstances included in subsections F and G of this section.

E. In determining whether to impose a sentence of death or life imprisonment, the trier of fact shall take into account the aggravating and mitigating circumstances that have been proven. The trier of fact shall impose a sentence of death if the trier of fact finds one or more of the aggravating circumstances enumerated in subsection F of this section and then determines that there are no mitigating circumstances
 sufficiently substantial to call for leniency.

F. The trier of fact shall consider the following aggravating
circumstances in determining whether to impose a sentence of death:

5 1. The defendant has been convicted of another offense in the 6 United States for which under Arizona law a sentence of life imprisonment 7 or death was imposable.

8 2. The defendant has been or was previously convicted of a serious 9 offense, whether preparatory or completed. Convictions for serious 10 offenses committed on the same occasion as the homicide, or not committed 11 on the same occasion but consolidated for trial with the homicide, shall 12 be treated as a serious offense under this paragraph.

13 3. The defendant procured the commission of the offense by payment, 14 or promise of payment, of anything of pecuniary value, or the defendant 15 committed the offense as a result of payment, or a promise of payment, of 16 anything of pecuniary value.

17 4. The defendant committed the offense in an especially heinous,18 cruel or depraved manner.

19

5. The defendant committed the offense while:

(a) In the custody of or on authorized or unauthorized release from
 the state department of corrections, a law enforcement agency or a county
 or city jail.

23

(b) On probation for a felony offense.

6. The defendant has been convicted of one or more other homicides, as defined in section 13-1101, that were committed during the commission of the offense.

7. The defendant was an adult at the time the offense was committed or was tried as an adult and the murdered person was under fifteen years of age, was an unborn child in the womb at any stage of its development or was seventy years of age or older.

8. The murdered person was an on duty peace officer who was killed in the course of performing the officer's official duties and the defendant knew, or should have known, that the murdered person was a peace officer.

9. The defendant committed the offense with the intent to promote,
 further or assist the objectives of a criminal street gang or criminal
 syndicate or to join a criminal street gang or criminal syndicate.

38 10. The defendant committed the offense to prevent a person's 39 cooperation with an official law enforcement investigation, to prevent a 40 person's testimony in a court proceeding, in retaliation for a person's 41 cooperation with an official law enforcement investigation or in 42 retaliation for a person's testimony in a court proceeding.

G. The trier of fact shall consider as mitigating circumstances any factors proffered by the defendant or the state that are relevant in determining whether to impose a sentence less than death, including any 1 aspect of the defendant's character, propensities or record and any of the 2 circumstances of the offense, including but not limited to the following:

3 1. The defendant's capacity to appreciate the wrongfulness of his 4 conduct or to conform his conduct to the requirements of law was 5 significantly impaired, but not so impaired as to constitute a defense to 6 prosecution.

7 2. The defendant was under unusual and substantial duress, although8 not such as to constitute a defense to prosecution.

9 3. The defendant was legally accountable for the conduct of another 10 under section 13-303, but his participation was relatively minor, although 11 not so minor as to constitute a defense to prosecution.

12 4. The defendant could not reasonably have foreseen that his 13 conduct in the course of the commission of the offense for which the 14 defendant was convicted would cause, or would create a grave risk of 15 causing, death to another person.

16

27

28

5. The defendant's age.

H. For the purposes of determining whether a conviction of any dangerous crime against children is a serious offense pursuant to this section, an unborn child shall be treated like a minor who is under twelve years of age.

I. In this section, for purposes of punishment an unborn child shall be treated like a minor who is under twelve years of age.

J. For the purposes of this section, "serious offense" means any of the following offenses if committed in this state or any offense committed outside this state that if committed in this state would constitute one of the following offenses:

- 1. First degree murder.
- 2. Second degree murder.
- 29 3. Manslaughter.

30 4. Aggravated assault resulting in serious physical injury or 31 committed by the use, threatened use or exhibition of a deadly weapon or 32 dangerous instrument.

33 5. Sexual assault.

34 6. Any dangerous crime against children.

- 35 7. Arson of an occupied structure.
- 36 8. Robbery.

37 9. Burglary in the first degree.

- 38 10. Kidnapping.
- 39 11. Sexual conduct with a minor under fifteen years of age.
- 40 12. Burglary in the second degree.
- 41 13. Terrorism.

46

1 Sec. 3. Section 13-752, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to 2 read: 3 13-752. Sentences of death, life imprisonment or natural 4 life; imposition; sentencing proceedings; 5 <u>definitions</u> 6 A. If the state has filed a notice of intent to seek the death 7 penalty and the defendant is convicted of first degree murder, the trier 8 of fact at the sentencing proceeding shall determine whether to impose a 9 sentence of death in accordance with the procedures provided in this 10 section. If the trier of fact determines that a sentence of death is not appropriate, or if the state has not filed a notice of intent to seek the 11 12 death penalty, and the defendant is convicted of first degree murder 13 pursuant to section 13–1105, subsection A, paragraph 1 or 3 and was at 14 least eighteen years of age at the time of the commission of the offense, 15 the court shall impose a sentence of natural life. If the defendant was 16 under eighteen years of age at the time of the commission of the offense 17 or if the defendant is convicted of first degree murder pursuant to 18 section 13-1105, subsection A, paragraph 2, the court shall determine 19 whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life. 20 B. Before trial, the prosecution shall notice one or more of the 21 aggravating circumstances under section 13-751, subsection F. 22 C. If the trier of fact finds the defendant guilty of first degree 23 murder, the trier of fact shall then immediately determine whether one or 24 more alleged aggravating circumstances have been proven. This proceeding 25 is the aggravation phase of the sentencing proceeding. D. If the trier of fact finds that one or more of the alleged 26 27 aggravating circumstances have been proven, the trier of fact shall then immediately determine whether the death penalty should be imposed. 28 This 29 proceeding is the penalty phase of the sentencing proceeding. 30 E. At the aggravation phase, the trier of fact shall make a special 31 finding on whether each alleged aggravating circumstance has been proven 32 based on the evidence that was presented at the trial or at the 33 aggravation phase. If the trier of fact is a jury, a unanimous verdict is 34 required to find that the aggravating circumstance has been proven. If 35 the trier of fact unanimously finds that an aggravating circumstance has 36 not been proven, the defendant is entitled to a special finding that the 37 aggravating circumstance has not been proven. If the trier of fact 38 unanimously finds no aggravating circumstances, the court shall then 39 determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life on the 40 defendant pursuant to subsection A of this section. F. The penalty phase shall be held immediately after the trier of 41 42 fact finds at the aggravation phase that one or more of the aggravating 43 circumstances under section 13-751, subsection F have been proven. A 44 finding by the trier of fact that any of the remaining aggravating 45 circumstances alleged has not been proven or the inability of the trier of

fact to agree on the issue of whether any of the remaining aggravating

1 circumstances alleged has been proven shall not prevent the holding of the 2 penalty phase.

G. At the penalty phase, the defendant and the state may present 3 4 any evidence that is relevant to the determination of whether there is 5 mitigation that is sufficiently substantial to call for leniency. Ιn 6 order for the trier of fact to make this determination, regardless of 7 whether the defendant presents evidence of mitigation, the state may 8 present any evidence that demonstrates that the defendant should not be 9 shown leniency including any evidence regarding the defendant's character, 10 propensities, criminal record or other acts.

H. The trier of fact shall determine unanimously whether death is the appropriate sentence. If the trier of fact is a jury and the jury unanimously determines that the death penalty is not appropriate, the court shall determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life pursuant to subsection A of this section.

I. If the trier of fact at any prior phase of the trial is the same trier of fact at the subsequent phase, any evidence that was presented at any prior phase of the trial shall be deemed admitted as evidence at any subsequent phase of the trial.

20 J. At the aggravation phase, if the trier of fact is a jury, the 21 jury is unable to reach a verdict on any of the alleged aggravating 22 circumstances and the jury has not found that at least one of the alleged 23 aggravating circumstances has been proven, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry the issue 24 25 of the defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating 26 circumstances that the first jury found not proved by unanimous verdict. 27 If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, the court shall 28 impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.

29 K. At the penalty phase, if the trier of fact is a jury and the 30 jury is unable to reach a verdict, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry the issue of the 31 32 defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury found by unanimous verdict to be proved 33 34 or not proved. If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, 35 the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural life on the 36 defendant.

37 L. If the jury that rendered a verdict of guilty is not the jury first impaneled for the aggravation phase, the jury impaneled in the 38 39 aggravation phase shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt. If 40 the jury impaneled in the aggravation phase is unable to reach a verdict 41 on any of the alleged aggravating circumstances and the jury has not found 42 that at least one of the alleged aggravating circumstances has been 43 proven, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. 44 The new jury shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt or the 45 issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury 46 found not proved by unanimous verdict. If the new jury is unable to reach 1 a unanimous verdict, the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural 2 life on the defendant.

M. Alternate jurors who are impaneled for the trial in a case in which the offense is punishable by death shall not be excused from the case until the completion of the sentencing proceeding.

6 N. If the sentence of a person who was sentenced to death is 7 overturned, the person shall be resentenced pursuant to this section by a 8 jury that is specifically impaneled for this purpose as if the original 9 sentencing had not occurred.

0. In any case that requires sentencing or resentencing in which the defendant has been convicted of an offense that is punishable by death and in which the trier of fact was a judge or a jury that has since been discharged, the defendant shall be sentenced or resentenced pursuant to this section by a jury that is specifically impaneled for this purpose.

P. The trier of fact shall make all factual determinations required by this section or the Constitution of the United States or this state to impose a death sentence. If the defendant bears the burden of proof, the issue shall be determined in the penalty phase. If the state bears the burden of proof, the issue shall be determined in the aggravation phase.

Q. If the death penalty was not alleged or was alleged but not imposed, the court shall determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life pursuant to subsection A of this section. In determining whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life, the court:

May consider any evidence introduced before sentencing or at any
 other sentencing proceeding.

26 2. Shall consider the aggravating and mitigating circumstances 27 listed in section 13–701 and any statement made by a victim.

R. Subject to section 13-751, subsection B, a victim has the right to be present at the aggravation phase and to present any information that is relevant to the proceeding. A victim has the right to be present and to present information at the penalty phase. At the penalty phase, the victim may present information about the murdered person and the impact of the murder on the victim and other family members and may submit a victim impact statement in any format to the trier of fact.

35

S. For the purposes of this section:

"Trier of fact" means a jury unless the defendant and the state
 waive a jury, in which case the trier of fact shall be the court.

2. "Victim" means the murdered person's spouse, parent, child, grandparent or sibling, any other person related to the murdered person by consanguinity or affinity to the second degree or any other lawful representative of the murdered person, except if the spouse, parent, child, grandparent, sibling, other person related to the murdered person by consanguinity or affinity to the second degree or other lawful representative is in custody for an offense or is the accused.

1 Sec. 4. Section 13-1423, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to 2 read: 3 13-1423. Violent sexual assault; natural life sentence 4 A. A person is guilty of violent sexual assault if in the course of 5 committing an offense under section 13-1404, 13-1405, 13-1406 or 13-1410 6 the offense involved the discharge, use or threatening exhibition of a 7 deadly weapon or dangerous instrument or involved the intentional or 8 knowing infliction of serious physical injury and the person has a 9 historical prior felony conviction for a sexual offense under this chapter 10 or any offense committed outside this state that if committed in this state would constitute a sexual offense under this chapter. 11 12 B. Notwithstanding section 13-703, section 13-704, section 13-705, 13 section 13-706, subsection A and section 13-708, subsection D, a person who is AT LEAST EIGHTEEN YEARS OF AGE AND WHO IS guilty of a violent 14 sexual assault shall be sentenced to life imprisonment and the court shall 15 16 order that the person not be released on any basis for the remainder of 17 the person's natural life. 18 Sec. 5. Section 13-2308.01, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to 19 read: 20 13-2308.01. <u>Terrorism: classification</u> 21 A. It is unlawful for a person to intentionally or knowingly do any 22 of the following: 23 1. Engage in an act of terrorism. 24 2. Organize, manage, direct, supervise or finance an act of 25 terrorism. 26 3. Solicit, incite or induce others to promote or further an act of 27 terrorism. 4. Without lawful authority or when exceeding lawful authority, 28 29 manufacture, sell, deliver, display, use, make accessible to others, 30 possess or exercise control over a weapon of mass destruction knowing or having reason to know that the device or object involved is a weapon of 31 32 mass destruction. 33 5. Make property available to another, by transaction. 34 transportation or otherwise, knowing or having reason to know that the 35 property is intended to facilitate an act of terrorism. 36 6. Provide advice, assistance or direction in the conduct. 37 financing or management of an act of terrorism knowing or having reason to 38 know that an act of terrorism has occurred or may result by: 39 (a) Harboring or concealing any person or property. 40 (b) Warning any person of impending discovery, apprehension, 41 prosecution or conviction. This subdivision does not apply to a warning 42 that is given in connection with an effort to bring another person into 43 compliance with the law. 44 (c) Providing any person with material support or resources or any 45 of avoiding discovery, apprehension, prosecution other means or 46 conviction. - 8 -

(d) Concealing or disguising the nature, location, source,
 ownership or control of material support or resources.

3 (e) Preventing or obstructing by means of force, deception or 4 intimidation anyone from performing an act that might aid in the 5 discovery, apprehension, prosecution or conviction of any person or that 6 might aid in the prevention of an act of terrorism.

7 (f) Suppressing by any act of concealment, alteration or
8 destruction any physical evidence that might aid in the discovery,
9 apprehension, prosecution or conviction of any person or that might aid in
10 the prevention of an act of terrorism.

11

(g) Concealing the identity of any person.

12 7. Provide advice, assistance or direction in the conduct,13 financing or management of a terrorist organization.

14

29

30

31 32 B. A violation of this section is a class 2 felony.

15 C. A person who is convicted of a violation of this section may be sentenced to imprisonment in the custody of the state department of 16 17 corrections for life or, IF THE PERSON WAS AT LEAST EIGHTEEN YEARS OF AGE 18 AT THE TIME OF THE COMMISSION OF THE OFFENSE, natural life. A defendant 19 who is sentenced to natural life is not eligible for commutation, parole, 20 work furlough, work release or release from confinement on any basis for 21 the remainder of the defendant's natural life. A defendant who is 22 sentenced to life is not eligible for suspension of sentence, probation, 23 pardon or release from confinement on any basis except as specifically authorized by section 13-716 or section 31-233, subsection A or B until 24 25 the completion of the service of twenty-five calendar years or the sentence is commuted. If the defendant is not sentenced to life or 26 27 natural life, the defendant shall be sentenced to a term of imprisonment 28 as follows:

MinimumPresumptiveMaximum10 calendar years16 calendar years25 calendar yearsSec. 6.Juveniles sentenced to natural life or at leasttwenty-five calendar years; commutation

The supreme court shall remand to the original sentencing court each case in which a person was sentenced before the effective date of this act to natural life or to a term of imprisonment, including consecutive sentences, of at least twenty-five calendar years for an offense that was committed before the person attained eighteen years of age. The original sentencing court shall strike the sentence and enter in its place a sentence of either:

I. If the sentence was for natural life, life with the possibilityfor parole after serving twenty-five calendars years.

42 2. If the original sentence, including consecutive sentences, was
43 for a term of at least twenty-five calendar years, a sentence with parole
44 eligibility on completion of the service of twenty-five calendar years.