State of Arizona Senate Fiftieth Legislature First Regular Session 2011

SENATE CONCURRENT RESOLUTION 1001

A CONCURRENT RESOLUTION

PROPOSING AN AMENDMENT TO THE CONSTITUTION OF ARIZONA; AMENDING ARTICLE VI, SECTIONS 4, 12, 20, 36, 37, 39, 41 AND 42, CONSTITUTION OF ARIZONA; RELATING TO THE JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

(TEXT OF BILL BEGINS ON NEXT PAGE)

- i -

Be it resolved by the Senate of the State of Arizona, the House of Representatives concurring:

- 1. Article VI, sections 4, 12, 20, 36, 37, 39, 41 and 42, Constitution of Arizona, are proposed to be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the Governor:
 - 4. Supreme court: appellate court: term of office

Section 4. A. THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2012, justices of the supreme court shall hold office for a regular term of six years except as provided by this article.

B. FOR ANY TERM BEGINNING ON OR AFTER JANUARY 1, 2013, JUSTICES OF THE SUPREME COURT AND JUDGES OF ANY INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT SHALL HOLD OFFICE FOR A REGULAR TERM OF EIGHT YEARS EXCEPT AS PROVIDED BY THIS ARTICLE.

12. Superior court; term of office

Section 12. A. Judges of the superior court in counties having a population of less than two hundred fifty thousand persons according to the most recent United States census shall be elected by the qualified electors of their counties at the general election. THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2012, they shall hold office for a regular term of four years except as provided by this section from and after the first Monday in January next succeeding their election, and until their successors are elected and qualify. FOR ANY TERM BEGINNING ON OR AFTER JANUARY 1, 2013, THEY SHALL HOLD OFFICE FOR A REGULAR TERM OF EIGHT YEARS EXCEPT AS PROVIDED BY THIS SECTION FROM AND AFTER THE FIRST MONDAY IN JANUARY NEXT SUCCEEDING THEIR ELECTION. AND UNTIL THEIR SUCCESSORS ARE ELECTED AND QUALIFY. The names of all candidates for judge of the superior court in such counties shall be placed on the regular ballot without partisan or other designation except the division and title of the office.

- B. The governor shall fill any vacancy in such counties by appointing a person to serve until the election and qualification of a successor. At the next succeeding general election following the appointment of a person to fill a vacancy, a judge shall be elected to serve for the remainder of the unexpired term.
- C. THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2012, judges of the superior court in counties having a population of two hundred fifty thousand persons or more according to the most recent United States census shall hold office for a regular term of four years except as provided by this article. FOR ANY TERM BEGINNING ON OR AFTER JANUARY 1, 2013, JUDGES OF THE SUPERIOR COURT IN COUNTIES HAVING A POPULATION OF TWO HUNDRED FIFTY THOUSAND PERSONS OR MORE ACCORDING TO THE MOST RECENT UNITED STATES CENSUS SHALL HOLD OFFICE FOR A REGULAR TERM OF EIGHT YEARS EXCEPT AS PROVIDED BY THIS ARTICLE.

- 1 -

20. Retirement and service of retired justices and judges

Section 20. A. The legislature shall prescribe by law a plan of retirement for justices and judges of courts of record, including the basis and amount of retirement pay, and requiring except as provided in section 35 of this article, that justices and judges of courts of record be retired upon ON reaching the age of seventy SEVENTY-FIVE YEARS OF AGE.

B. Any retired justice or judge of any court of record who is drawing retirement pay may serve as a justice or judge of any court. When serving outside his county of residence, any such retired justice or judge shall receive his necessary traveling and subsistence expenses. A retired judge who is temporarily called back to the active duties of a judge is entitled to receive the same compensation and expenses as other like active judges less any amount received for such period in retirement benefits.

36. <u>Commission on appellate court appointments and terms, appointments and vacancies on commission</u>

Section 36. A. There shall be A nonpartisan commission on appellate court appointments which shall be composed of IS ESTABLISHED AND CONSISTS OF THE FOLLOWING MEMBERS:

- 1. The chief justice of the supreme court, who shall be chairman. IN THE EVENT OF THE ABSENCE OR INCAPACITY OF THE CHAIRMAN, THE SUPREME COURT SHALL APPOINT A JUSTICE OF THE SUPREME COURT TO SERVE IN THE CHIEF JUSTICE'S PLACE AND STEAD.
- 2. Five attorney members, who shall be nominated by the board of governors of the state bar of Arizona and appointed by the governor FOLLOWING PEOPLE with the advice and consent of the senate in the manner prescribed by law: , and
 - (a) THE GOVERNOR SHALL APPOINT FOUR OF THE MEMBERS.
- (b) THE PRESIDENT OF THE STATE BAR OF ARIZONA SHALL APPOINT ONE OF THE MEMBERS WHO SHALL BE A MEMBER OF THE STATE BAR OF ARIZONA.
- 3. Ten nonattorney members who shall be appointed by the governor with the advice and consent of the senate in the manner prescribed by law.
- B. At least ninety days prior to BEFORE a term expiring or within twenty-one days of a vacancy occurring for a nonattorney AN ATTORNEY member on the commission for ON appellate court appointments, the governor shall appoint a nominating committee of nine members, not more than five of whom may be from the same political party. The makeup of the committee shall, to the extent feasible, reflect the diversity of the population of the state. Members shall not be attorneys and shall not hold any governmental office, elective or

- 2 -

appointive, for profit. The committee shall provide public notice that a vacancy exists and shall solicit, review and forward to the governor all along with the committee's recommendations for appointment. STATE BAR OF ARIZONA SHALL SOLICIT, REVIEW AND FORWARD TO THE GOVERNOR ALL APPLICATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT ALONG WITH THE STATE BAR'S RECOMMENDATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT.

- C. Attorney members of the commission shall have resided in the state and shall have been admitted to practice before the supreme court for not less than five TEN years, SHALL BE MEMBERS IN GOOD STANDING OF THE STATE BAR OF ARIZONA, SHALL HAVE NO FORMAL DISCIPLINARY COMPLAINTS AND SHALL NOT HAVE EVER BEEN FORMALLY SANCTIONED AS A RESULT OF A DISCIPLINARY ACTION. Not more than three attorney members shall be members of the same political party and not more than two attorney members shall be residents of any one county.
- D. Nonattorney Members WHO ARE NOMINATED PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION A, PARAGRAPH 3 shall have resided in the state for not less than five years and shall not be judges, retired judges or admitted to practice before the supreme court. Not more than five nonattorney members shall be members of the same political party. Not more than two nonattorney members shall be residents of any one county.
- E. None of The attorney or AND nonattorney members of the commission shall NOT hold any governmental office, elective or appointive, for profit, and no AN attorney member OF THE COMMISSION shall NOT be eligible for appointment to any judicial office of the state until one year after he THE ATTORNEY MEMBER ceases to be a member OF THE COMMISSION.
- F. Attorney Members of the commission shall serve staggered four-year terms and nonattorney members shall serve staggered four year terms. Vacancies shall be filled for the unexpired terms in the same manner as the original appointments.
- $$B_{\hbox{\scriptsize --}}$$ G. No person other than the chief justice shall serve at the same time as a member of more than one judicial appointment commission.
- C. H. In making or confirming appointments to the appellate court commission, the governor, the senate and the PRESIDENT OF THE state bar shall endeavor to see that the commission reflects the diversity of Arizona's population.

In the event of the absence or incapacity of the chairman the supreme court shall appoint a justice thereof to serve in his place and stead.

D. I. Prior to BEFORE making recommendations to the governor as hereinafter provided, the commission shall conduct investigations, hold public hearings and take public testimony.

- 3 -

An executive session as prescribed by rule may be held upon ON a two-thirds vote of the members of the commission in a public hearing. Final decisions as to recommendations shall be made without regard to political affiliation in an impartial and objective manner. The commission shall consider the diversity of the state's population, however the primary consideration shall be merit. Voting shall be in a public hearing. The expenses of meetings of the commission and the attendance of members thereof for travel and subsistence shall be paid from the general fund of the state as state officers are paid, upon ON claims approved by the chairman.

 $\mathsf{E}.$ J. After public hearings the supreme court shall adopt rules of procedure for the commission on appellate court appointments.

F. Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection A, the initial appointments for the five additional nonattorney members and the two additional attorney members of the commission shall be designated by the governor for staggered terms as follows:

1. One appointment for a nonattorney member shall be for a one-year term.

2. Two appointments for nonattorney members shall be for a two-year term.

3. Two appointments for nonattorney members shall be for a three-year term.

4. One appointment for an attorney member shall be for a one-year term.

5. One appointments for an attorney member shall be for a two-year term.

G. The members currently serving on the commission may continue to serve until the expiration of their normal terms. All subsequent appointments shall be made as prescribed by this section.

37. <u>Judicial vacancies and appointments; initial</u> terms; residence; age

Section 37. A. Within sixty days from the occurrence of a ANY vacancy in the office of a justice or judge of any court of record, except for vacancies occurring in the office of a judge of the superior court or a judge of a court of record inferior to the superior court THE SUPREME COURT OR AN INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT OF RECORD, the commission on appellate court appointments, if the vacancy is in the supreme court or an intermediate appellate court of record, shall submit to the governor the names of not less than three EIGHT persons nominated by it to fill such EACH vacancy, no more than two of whom shall be members of the same political party unless there are more than four such nominees, in which event not more than

- 4 -

2

3

4 5

6

7

8

9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

3435

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

sixty percentum of such nominees shall be members of the same political party, EXCEPT THAT ON A TWO-THIRDS VOTE, THE COMMISSION MAY REJECT AN APPLICANT AND SUBMIT LESS THAN EIGHT NAMES. ANY APPLICANT WHO RECEIVES A MAJORITY VOTE OF THE VOTING MEMBERS FOR NOMINATION SHALL BE NOMINATED FOR THE VACANCY. IF MORE THAN ONE VACANCY EXISTS IN THE SAME COURT AT THE SAME TIME, THE COMMISSION SHALL SUBMIT THE NAMES OF NOT LESS THAN SIX PERSONS NOMINATED BY IT TO FILL EACH VACANCY AND SHALL NOT SUBMIT THE NAME OF THE SAME PERSON FOR MORE THAN ONE VACANCY.

- B. Within sixty days from the occurrence of $\frac{a}{a}$ ANY vacancy in the office of a judge of the superior court or a judge of a court of record inferior to the superior court except for vacancies occurring in the office of a judge of the superior court or a judge of a court of record inferior to the superior court in a county having a population of less than two hundred fifty thousand persons according to the most recent United States census, the commission on trial court appointments for the county in which the vacancy occurs shall submit to the governor the names of not less than three EIGHT persons nominated by it to fill such vacancy, no more than two of whom shall be members of the same political party unless there are more than four such nominees, in which event no more than sixty per centum of such nominees shall be members of the same political party, EXCEPT THAT ON A TWO-THIRDS VOTE, THE COMMISSION MAY REJECT AN APPLICANT AND SUBMIT LESS THAN EIGHT NAMES. ANY APPLICANT WHO RECEIVES A MAJORITY VOTE OF THE VOTING MEMBERS FOR NOMINATION SHALL BE NOMINATED FOR THE VACANCY. IF MORE THAN ONE VACANCY EXISTS IN THE SAME COURT AT THE SAME TIME. THE COMMISSION SHALL SUBMIT THE NAMES OF NOT LESS THAN SIX PERSONS NOMINATED BY IT TO FILL EACH VACANCY AND SHALL NOT SUBMIT THE NAME OF THE SAME PERSON FOR MORE THAN ONE VACANCY. A nominee shall be under sixty-five years of age at the time his THE NOMINEE'S name is submitted to the governor. Judges of the superior court shall be subject to retention or rejection by a vote of the qualified electors of the county from which they were appointed at the general election in the manner provided by section 38 of this article.
- C. A vacancy in the office of a justice or a judge of such courts of record shall be filled by appointment by the governor without regard to political affiliation from one of the nominees whose names shall be submitted to him THE GOVERNOR as hereinabove provided. IF MORE THAN ONE VACANCY EXISTS IN THE SAME COURT AT THE SAME TIME, THE GOVERNOR MAY MAKE AN APPOINTMENT FROM ANY OF THE NOMINEES PRESENTED FOR ANY OF THE VACANCIES IN THAT COURT. In making the appointment, the governor shall consider the diversity of the state's population

- 5 -

for an appellate court appointment and the diversity of the county's population for a trial court appointment, however the primary consideration shall be merit. If the governor does not appoint one of such THE nominees to fill such THE vacancy within sixty days after their names are submitted to the governor by such THE commission, the chief justice of the supreme court forthwith shall appoint on the basis of merit alone without regard to political affiliation one of such THE nominees to fill such THE vacancy. If such THE commission does not, within sixty days after such THE vacancy occurs, submit the names of nominees as hereinabove provided, the governor shall have the power to MAY appoint any qualified person to fill such THE vacancy at any time thereafter prior to BEFORE the time the names of the nominees to fill such THE vacancy are submitted to the governor as hereinabove provided.

- D. Each APPOINTED justice or judge so appointed shall initially hold office for a term ending sixty days following the next regular general election after the expiration of a term of two years in office. Thereafter, the terms of justices or judges of the supreme court and the superior court shall be as provided by this article.
- D. E. A person appointed to fill a vacancy on an intermediate appellate court or another court of record now existing or hereafter established by law shall have been a resident of the counties or county in which that vacancy exists for at least one year prior to his BEFORE THE PERSON'S appointment, in addition to possessing the other required qualifications. A nominee shall be under sixty-five years of age at the time his THE NOMINEE'S name is submitted to the governor.

39. Retirement of justices and judges: vacancies

Section 39. A. On attaining the age of seventy SEVENTY-FIVE years OF AGE a justice or judge of a court of record shall retire and his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S judicial office shall be vacant, except as otherwise provided in section 35 of this article. In addition to becoming vacant as provided in this section, the office of a justice or judge of any court of record becomes vacant upon his ON THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S death, or his voluntary retirement pursuant to statute or his voluntary resignation, and also, as provided in section 38 of this article, upon ON the expiration of his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S term next following a general election at which a majority of those voting on the question of his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S retention vote in the negative or for which general election he THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE is required, but fails, to file a declaration of his desire to be retained in office.

- 6 -

B. This section is alternative to and cumulative with the methods of removal of judges and justices provided in ARTICLE VI.I AND ARTICLE VIII, parts 1 and 2 of article 8 and article 6.1 of this Constitution.

41. Commission on trial court appointments:

membership: terms

A. Except as otherwise provided, judges of the superior court in counties having a population of two hundred fifty thousand persons or more according to the most recent United States census shall hold office for a regular term of four years.

- B. A. There shall be a nonpartisan commission on trial court appointments for each county having a population of two hundred fifty thousand persons or more according to the most recent United States census which shall be composed of the following members:
- 1. The chief justice of the supreme court, who shall be the chairman of the commission. In the event of the absence or incapacity of the chairman the supreme court shall appoint a justice thereof to serve in his place and stead.
- 2. Five attorney members, none of whom shall reside in the same supervisorial district and not more than three of whom shall be members of the same political party, who are nominated by the board of governors of the state bar of Arizona and who are appointed by the governor FOLLOWING PEOPLE subject to confirmation by the senate in the manner prescribed by law:
 - (a) THE GOVERNOR SHALL APPOINT FOUR OF THE MEMBERS.
- (b) THE PRESIDENT OF THE STATE BAR OF ARIZONA SHALL APPOINT ONE OF THE MEMBERS WHO SHALL BE A MEMBER OF THE STATE BAR.
- 3. Ten nonattorney members, no more than two of whom shall reside in the same supervisorial district.
- E. B. At least ninety days prior to BEFORE a term expiring or within twenty-one days of a vacancy occurring for anonattorney AN ATTORNEY member on the commission for trial court appointments, the member of the board of supervisors from the district in which the vacancy has occurred shall appoint a nominating committee of seven members who reside in the district, not more than four of whom may be from the same political party. The make-up of the committee shall, to the extent feasible, reflect the diversity of the population of the district. Members shall not be attorneys and shall not hold any governmental office, elective or appointive, for profit. The committee shall provide public notice that a vacancy exists and shall solicit, review and forward to the governor all applications along with the committee's recommendations for

- 7 -

STATE BAR OF ARIZONA SHALL SOLICIT, REVIEW AND FORWARD TO THE GOVERNOR ALL APPLICATIONS FOR APPOINTMENT ALONG WITH THE STATE BAR'S RECOMMENDATIONS FOR appointment. The governor shall appoint two persons from each supervisorial district who shall not be of the same political party, subject to confirmation by the senate in the manner prescribed by law.

D. C. In making or confirming appointments to trial court commissions, the governor, the senate and the PRESIDENT OF THE state bar shall endeavor to see that the commission reflects the diversity of the county's population.

E. Members of the commission shall serve staggered four year terms, except that initial appointments for the five additional nonattorney members and the two additional attorney members of the commission shall be designated by the governor as follows:

1. One appointment for a nonattorney member shall be for a one-year term.

2. Two appointments for nonattorney members shall be for a two-year term.

3. Two appointments for nonattorney members shall be for a three-year term.

4. One appointment for an attorney member shall be for a one-year term.

5. One appointment for an attorney member shall be for a two-year term.

 \digamma . D. Vacancies shall be filled for the unexpired terms in the same manner as the original appointments.

G. E. Attorney members of the commission shall have resided in this state and shall have been admitted to practice in this state by the supreme court for at least five TEN years, SHALL BE MEMBERS IN GOOD STANDING OF THE STATE BAR OF ARIZONA, SHALL HAVE NO FORMAL DISCIPLINARY COMPLAINTS, SHALL NOT HAVE EVER BEEN FORMALLY SANCTIONED AS A RESULT OF A DISCIPLINARY ACTION and shall have resided in the supervisorial district from which they are appointed for at least one year. Nonattorney members shall have resided in this state for at least five years, shall have resided in the supervisorial district for at least one year before being nominated and shall not be judges, retired judges nor admitted to practice before the supreme court. None of the attorney or nonattorney members of the commission shall hold any governmental office, elective or appointive, for profit and no attorney member is eligible for appointment to any judicial office of this state until one year after membership in the commission terminates.

- 8 -

H. F. No person other than the chief justice shall serve at the same time as a member of more than one judicial appointment commission.

I. G. The commission shall submit the names of not less than three EIGHT individuals for nomination for the office of the superior court judge pursuant to section 37 of this article.

J. H. Prior to BEFORE making recommendations to the governor, the commission shall conduct investigations, hold public hearings and take public testimony. An executive session as prescribed by rule may be held upon a two-thirds vote of the members of the commission in a public hearing. Final decisions as to recommendations shall be made without regard to political affiliation in an impartial and objective manner. The commission shall consider the diversity of the county's population and the geographical distribution of the residences of the judges throughout the county, however the primary consideration shall be merit. Voting shall be in a public hearing. The expenses of meetings of the commission and the attendance of members thereof for travel and subsistence shall be paid from the general fund of the state as state officers are paid, upon claims approved by the chairman.

 $\mathsf{K.}$ I. After public hearings the supreme court shall adopt rules of procedure for the commission on trial court appointments.

L. The members of the commission who were appointed pursuant to section 36 of this article prior to the effective date of this section may continue to serve until the expiration of their normal terms. All subsequent appointments shall be made as prescribed by this section.

42. Retention evaluation of justices and judges: electronically accessible information: performance review hearings

A. The supreme court shall adopt, after public hearings, and administer for all justices and judges who file a declaration to be retained in office, a process, established by court rules for evaluating judicial performance. The rules shall include written performance standards and performance reviews which survey opinions of persons who have knowledge of the justice's or judge's performance. The public shall be afforded a full and fair opportunity for participation in the evaluation process through public hearings, dissemination of evaluation reports to voters and any other methods as the court deems advisable.

B. THE SUPREME COURT SHALL MAKE EVERY WRITTEN OPINION OR ORDER THAT IS ISSUED BY A JUDGE OF A COURT OF RECORD, THAT RESOLVES A CONTESTED MATTER OF LAW AND THAT IS NOT SEALED OR

- 9 -

4

6 7

8 9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16

1 CONFIDENTIAL PURSUANT TO LAW ELECTRONICALLY ACCESSIBLE TO THE 2 PUBLIC THROUGH THE SUPREME COURT'S WEBSITE.

C. NOT LATER THAN SIXTY DAYS PRECEDING THE REGULAR PRIMARY ELECTION THE SUPREME COURT SHALL TRANSMIT A COPY OF THE JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE REVIEW OF EACH JUSTICE AND JUDGE WHO IS UP FOR RETENTION TO THE PRESIDENT OF THE SENATE AND THE SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES. NOT LATER THAN SIXTY DAYS PRECEDING THE REGULAR GENERAL ELECTION FOR THE RETENTION OF JUSTICES AND JUDGES, A JOINT LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE CONSISTING OF THE SENATE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE AND THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES JUDICIARY COMMITTEE, OR THEIR SUCCESSOR COMMITTEES, MAY MEET AND TAKE TESTIMONY ON THE JUSTICES AND JUDGES WHO ARE UP FOR RETENTION.

2. The Secretary of State shall submit this proposition to the voters at the next general election as provided by article XXI, Constitution of Arizona.

PASSED BY THE HOUSE APRIL 14, 2011.

PASSED BY THE SENATE MARCH 21, 2011.

SENATE CONCURS IN HOUSE AMENDMENTS AND FINAL PASSAGE APRIL 18, 2011.

FILED IN THE OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY OF STATE APRIL 19, 2011.

- 10 -