2000 ARIZONA STRATEGIC PROGRAM AREA REVIEW (SPAR)
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Laws 1999, Chapter 148 modified the program evaluation process for Arizona state government, creating the Strategic Program Area Review (SPAR) process. The SPARs provide an opportunity for the Governor and the Legislature to evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of programs crossing state agency lines. These reviews are a permanent part of the biennial budget process and result in decisions to retain, eliminate, or modify particular programs. Laws 1999, Chapter 148 specified three program areas for review during the 2000 legislative session: Arizona Ports of Entry, Domestic Violence, and University Extended Education. The President of the Senate and the Speaker of the House of Representatives are required to assign these SPARs to the Appropriations Committees and may additionally assign the SPARs to an appropriate standing committee. The assigned standing committees or the Appropriations Committees shall hold at least one public hearing to receive public input and to develop recommendations whether to retain, eliminate, or modify the program subject to the SPAR process.

Arizona Ports of Entry

JLBC Staff and OSPB conducted a SPAR focusing on the Non-Mexican Border Ports of Entry. The primary purpose of these ports is to ensure that commercial vehicles are in compliance with the state's weight, licensing, permit, and tax laws, as administered by the Motor Vehicle Division (MVD) of the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT). The Arizona Department of Agriculture (ADA) also uses the ports to screen trucks and their cargo to intercept agricultural pests, weeds, and livestock diseases. The Department of Public Safety (DPS) maintains a limited field presence at some ports, usually with one officer to perform safety inspections of commercial vehicles along with other patrol and field duties.

JLBC Staff and OSPB found that ADOT, DPS, and ADA benefit from sharing the ports. JLBC Staff also found that the level of cooperation between agencies has varied considerably. Although it may not be feasible to consolidate their port operations, there are definite opportunities for increased cooperation.

OSPB and JLBC Staff found that the ports are ADOT's dominant compliance mechanism and are useful in ADOT's enforcement of Arizona's truck size, weight, and tax laws. The lack of national benchmarks, systematic performance monitoring mechanism, and a current 5-Year Master Plan for the ports limited the ability of this review to conclusively establish the program's effectiveness, efficiency, or future direction.

JLBC Staff and OSPB agree that the three agencies should jointly seek ways to further staff cross-training and development. JLBC Staff specifically recommends that ADOT report on the more extensive use of cross-training to allow one person to conduct all checks and on the use of interagency team building. JLBC Staff also recommends that the three agencies make better use of interagency agreements to foster more cooperation and that the three agencies report on these and other items to the Governor and the Legislature by July 1, 2000. OSPB recommends interagency agreements between DPS and ADOT and between ADOT and ADA (but not between DPS and ADA). OSPB also recommends that ADOT notify in writing the JLBC and OSPB Directors on its progress by July 1, 2000.

OSPB and JLBC Staff also recommend that ADOT improve its data tracking system and performance measurements for the program and include them in ADOT's 5-Year Master Plan for the ports (last

updated in 1989). OSPB and JLBC Staff recommend that ADOT submit its updated 5-Year Master Plan for the ports to the Governor and the Legislature by July 1, 2000. OSPB and JLBC Staff also recommend that ADOT submit a report on how it has improved its collection, analysis, and use of data in these areas to the Governor and the Legislature by September 1, 2001.

Domestic Violence

JLBC Staff and OSPB conducted a SPAR of Domestic Violence services provided by state agencies. The SPAR followed up on work conducted in a 1998 Program Authorization Review (PAR). The SPAR focused on Domestic Violence programs in the Department of Economic Security (DES) and the Administrative Office of the Courts (AOC) but also looked at the Domestic Violence programs operated by 6 other state agencies. State agencies provide funding for a broad range of services, ranging from emergency shelter services and case management for victims to legal advocacy and assistance to prosecutors of domestic violence cases.

JLBC Staff found that, despite some instances of increased collaboration since 1997, lack of coordination between state agencies still inhibits the efficient allocation of resources among domestic violence shelters. To address this lack of coordination, JLBC Staff recommends consolidating funding related to direct services to victims within DES and funding related to law enforcement and prosecution with the Arizona Criminal Justice Commission (ACJC).

OSPB found that progress has been made since the original 1998 PAR, but that enhanced collaboration between agencies providing domestic violence services would increase efficiency. OSPB recommends that funding agencies participate in a new collaborative initiative to divide their resources amongst the shelters so that each shelter receives the appropriate level of funding. JLBC Staff believes that coordination of these resources cannot eliminate the inherent inefficiency of 6 different agencies providing direct services to domestic violence victims.

Both JLBC Staff and OSPB also found that the lack of outcome measures makes it difficult to evaluate overall effectiveness of the system. As a result, we recommend that DES report to the Governor and the Legislature by June 30, 2000 on the baseline cost-effectiveness information being collected and on other recommended outcome measures that should be developed in consultation with other state agencies and interested stakeholders.

University Extended Education

JLBC Staff and OSPB conducted a SPAR of University Extended Education programs at Arizona State University (ASU), Northern Arizona University (NAU) and the University of Arizona (UA). The SPAR followed up on work conducted in a 1998 PAR and looked at ASU's College of Extended Education, NAU's Personal and Professional Development program and Office of Management and Development, and UA's Extended University. The SPAR also looked at the array of university credit and non-credit extended education offerings. The Extended Education programs of each university focus on services to non-traditional students seeking courses at non-traditional times and sites. In particular, the role of off-campus credit-bearing education within the state's larger higher educational environment was examined.

JLBC Staff and OSPB found that the number of students enrolled in off-campus credit-bearing courses increased by 27.0% from FY 1997 to FY 1999, while total main campus enrollment increased by 1.6% during this same period. While Arizona Board of Regents (ABOR) policy sets guidelines for the service areas of each university and discusses the special role of televised courses, the current policies do not

provide guidance on the appropriate level of off-campus courses in the overall mix of educational offerings. Given the growing importance of off-campus education, JLBC Staff recommends that ABOR report to the Governor and the Legislature by November 1, 2000 on its policy for the use of off-campus course offerings. The policy should include criteria to determine when off-campus courses are most appropriate. OSPB makes no recommendation related to this finding.

JLBC Staff and OSPB found that coordination among universities with regard to distance learning may be inadequate and may create unnecessary duplication of services. As a result, JLBC Staff recommends that ABOR report to the Governor and the Legislature by November 1, 2000 on its policy to coordinate off-campus course offerings to ensure no unnecessary duplication of services. OSPB recommends using the Governor's Higher Education Taskforce for this purpose.

JLBC Staff and OSPB also found that the ABOR policy that describes which students will be counted for General Fund enrollment formula funding does not address clearly the wide range of extended education course delivery methods that now exist in the state. As a result, JLBC Staff recommends that ABOR create criteria for enrollment formula student counts that provide full state funding only to courses where the quality and cost of delivery are comparable to main campus courses. The policy should be written in a way that can accommodate future changes in educational delivery methods. JLBC Staff recommends that ABOR provide its findings to the Governor and the Legislature by November 1, 2000. OSPB recommends using the Governor's Higher Education Taskforce for this purpose.

OFFICE OF THE GOVERNOR
OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING AND BUDGETING
1700 West Washington, Suite 500
Phoenix, Arizona 85007
(602) 542-5381 • FAX: (602) 542-0868

JOINT LEGISLATIVE BUDGET COMMITTEE
STAFF
1716 W. Adams
Phoenix, Arizona 85007
(602) 542-5491 • FAX: (602) 542-1616

GOVERNOR
JANE DEE HULL

December 22, 1999

The Honorable Jane D. Hull, Governor
The Honorable Brenda Burns, President of the Senate
The Honorable Jeff Groscost, Speaker of the House
Arizona State Capitol
1700 W. Washington
Phoenix, AZ 85007

RE: Strategic Program Area Review

Dear Governor Hull, President Burns, and Speaker Groscost:

We are transmitting to you and the entire Legislature, the Strategic Program Area Review (SPAR) report required by A.R.S. § 41-1275. In accordance with this legislation, the Joint Legislative Budget Committee (JLBC) Staff and the Governor's Office of Strategic Planning and Budgeting (OSPB) have completed our review of three strategic program areas: Arizona Ports of Entry, Domestic Violence, and University Extended Education. The SPAR Reports are co-authored by each office. We share some findings and recommendations, while we disagree on others.

The attached SPAR report contains the following information: 1) an Executive Summary of the three SPAR reports, 2) the SPAR report for each program area, and 3) each agency's response to our review. These reports also are available through the web page of the JLBC Staff (www.azleg.state.az.us/jlbc.htm) or OSPB (www.state.az.us/ospb).

We look forward to presenting our review to the Appropriations Committees and to any other legislative committees to which they are assigned. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact us, or you can call Lynne Smith of the JLBC Staff at 542-5491 or Monica Klaschka of OSPB at 542-5381.

Sincerely,

Thomas J. Betlach
Director, OSPB

Richard Stavneak
Director, JLBC Staff